

1047 Porter Road, Geographic Township of Manvers (Graham Methodist Cemetery)

Heritage Designation Evaluation

Geographic Township of Manvers

MANVERS CON 8 S PT LOT 20 RP;57R10825 PART 1, MANVERS

2025



Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest

The subject property has been researched and evaluated in order to determine its cultural heritage significance under Ontario Regulation 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act R.S.O. 1990. A property is eligible for designation if it has physical, historical, associative or contextual value and meets any two of the nine criteria set out under Regulation 9/06 of the Act. Staff have determined that 1047 Porter Road has cultural heritage value or interest and merits designation under the Ontario Heritage Act.

1. The property has design value or physical value because it:

i. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material, or construction method:

The property is a representative example of a rural church cemetery. First established in the mid-nineteenth century as a cemetery for the New Connexion Methodist chapel constructed in the 1850s on the same site, it is demonstrative of rural cemeteries constructed alongside churches in the mid-nineteenth century including its placement of graves and limited landscaping and decorative elements, in contrast to more urban cemeteries developed at this time.

ii. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit:

The property displays a typical degree of craftsmanship for a property of this type.

iii. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement:

There are no specific technical or scientific achievements associated with this property.

2. The property has historical or associative value because it:

i. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization, or institution that is significant to the community:

The property has direct associations with the history of the Methodist Church in Manvers Township. The cemetery was originally established as a Methodist cemetery alongside the Graham Chapel, a New Connexion Methodist church built around 1845. The property is directly associated with the history of the church and this religious denomination in Bethany. The property is also associated with early Manvers settler John Graham who donated the land for the church and cemetery.

ii. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of a community or culture:

The property yields information regarding the history of death and burial in Manvers Township as well as the history of the Methodist church, with which this cemetery was originally associated.

iii. demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to the community:
There is no specific designer or builder associated with this property.

3. The property has contextual value because it:

i. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area:

The property is important in maintaining the historic rural character of the surrounding area as an early settler cemetery. The cemetery forms part of a broader rural agricultural landscape that includes a range of historic landscape features including agricultural areas and natural features. Taken together, these form a cohesive historic rural landscape and the cemetery supports that character as a typical rural cemetery that dates from the same period of development as its surroundings.

ii. is physically, functionally, visually, or historically linked to its surroundings:

The property is historically linked to its surroundings as part of the rural development of this area of Manvers Township in the mid-nineteenth century. The area in which the cemetery is located remains a rural agricultural area as it was when the cemetery was developed and there are a range of structures and landscape features, including lot and travel route patterns, that date from this period and remain on the landscape. These features, including the cemetery, developed together in the mid-nineteenth century as part of the agricultural settlement of Manvers Township.

iii. is a landmark.

The property is a landmark as the Graham Methodist Cemetery which remains an active cemetery and burial site. The property has served as a burial ground for the local area since that time and is a well-known site in the area of Manvers Township around Bethany. It is specifically connected to a number of well-known historic Manvers families who have members buried in it.

Design and Physical Value

1047 Porter Road has design and physical value as a representative example of a mid-nineteenth century rural cemetery. The cemetery was established in approximately 1850 as a burial ground for the local New Connexion Methodist congregation alongside a chapel constructed on the same site around the same time, which has been demolished. Through its landscaping, layout and orientation, the cemetery is demonstrative of the kinds of rural churchyard cemeteries established in the mid-nineteenth century, particularly in contrast to the growing trend of landscaped garden cemeteries being established in urban centres. The cemetery is one of eleven cemeteries in Manvers Township and one of the several that were established in the township around this period. It remains an important example of an early Methodist cemetery in Manvers Township.

The establishment of cemeteries was an early and regular part of non-Indigenous settler land use in Ontario, from the first arrival of Europeans in the province. Death and dying were a regular part of life in nineteenth century Ontario and burial sites an integral aspect of the landscape where funerary rites and customs could be observed. Cemeteries and burial grounds were organic and natural parts of the everyday landscapes of nineteenth century communities and served a vital purpose in local community culture. The first settlers created their own cemeteries, often on their own property to bury their deceased family members; this was particularly the case in the years immediately after settlers arrived in an area when there were no established community institutions and people died quickly and regularly. While death and burial at this time was still heavily associated with religion, primarily, in Ontario at this time, Christianity, the majority of early settlers did not have access to a local church and graveyard because, during the period of early settlement, they simply did not exist. Mortality amongst early settlers was high and family cemeteries were often the only place to bury the dead, particularly when there were no other families in the immediate vicinity. These cemeteries would be located in a convenient, or sometimes scenic, location on the family's landholding and each family member who died would be buried there. The continued usage of family cemeteries was largely dependant on when an area was settled and how many people lived there; while some areas in Ontario, particularly near Lake Ontario and Lake Erie had organized cemeteries dating back to the late eighteenth century, family burials were still taking place in some remote and rural areas at the turn of the twentieth century.

With additional settlement, but often still not church, a communal cemetery was often founded by a group of a local families, many of whom were often of the same denomination and culture, due to settlement patterns across the province where settlers of similar origins tended to cluster together. Land for this communal cemetery was usually donated by a local settler; small pioneer

cemeteries of this type are regular features across the rural Ontario landscape, with some evolving over the years into larger cemeteries, either associated with a church or as a non-denominational burying ground, but many were no longer used as communities continued to grow and develop. Often, a plot which had originally be established as a family cemetery would evolve into the community cemetery, simply by virtue of being the first place where someone happened to be buried in a local area and providing a convenient spot for other families to bury their dead nearby.

However, when a church was constructed, generally the cemetery was established in the churchyard; this was not always the case, but burying the dead in the churchyard was a longstanding Christian practice in Britain and Europe and it was continued when settlers came to Ontario. Occasionally, the opposite phenomenon occurred, particularly in rural areas, where the local church was constructed next to where the cemetery was already established. The interrelationship between rites and rituals that took place within the church and in the burying ground made their close proximity practical and necessary. It also separated out burials along denominational lines, creating cemeteries that received only members of a specific congregation or denomination; this sometimes caused a proliferation of small cemeteries in rural areas where each denomination established and maintained its own cemetery. As a result, the church and associated cemetery landscape became a well-recognized and typical feature across Ontario's rural and urban landscape.

Churchyard cemeteries, particularly those established in the early to mid-nineteenth century, were fairly consistent in their form which was typically relatively irregular and organic. While most churchyard cemeteries, and other rural cemeteries that did not have an adjacent place of worship, typically arranged gravestones in approximate rows, these were not always well-ordered or perfectly regular and were often subject to the local landscape, whether it be large trees or rocks or slopes that prevented the perfect and ordered arrangement of tombs and headstones.

Headstones appeared very early in the establishment of a graveyard; while some early family cemeteries did not initially include headstones, the installation of headstones quickly became a key aspect of Ontario cemeteries, as they were in Europe as an identification of where a person was buried and as a public memorial to them. The irregular rows of graves in the churchyard cemetery were marked by these headstones which themselves came in a variety of forms, shapes and sizes, depending largely on the preferences of the family, as well as their material resources to choose something more or less ornate and of what size. The most common headstone type was, by far, the vertical slab which included the name or names of the deceased, as well as dates of birth and death, symbolic carved imagery typically with connections

to Biblical themes, and, sometimes, additional text that was usually religious in nature. Other headstone types were also present in churchyard cemeteries, including obelisks, crosses and carved statuary are less common, and typically dated to later in the nineteenth century. It should be noted, however, that there are far fewer ornate headstones, particularly statuary, in rural nineteenth century cemeteries than their urban counterparts, likely indicative of fewer financial resources that in urban areas and a general preference for simpler forms.

By the mid-nineteenth century, however, ideas surrounding cemetery development were evolving, particularly in urban areas where churchyard cemeteries were filling up and increases in population meant that burials needed additional regulation both to ensure that there was somewhere for people to be buried and to ensure that burials were hygienic, sanitary and were not having negative impact on local communities. As a result, a new template for cemetery construction emerged that shifted cemeteries away from churches and towards a more secular and non-denominational space. These new cemeteries, often known as garden cemeteries, were non-denominational and not located in close proximity to a church; in fact, most were located right at the outer edge of the settlement area which they were associated. They were explicitly designed, sometimes by landscape architects, to create a pleasant and rural pastoral experience with landscaped areas, large trees, maintained gardens, and elaborate monuments and gravestones. The goal was to create a beautiful park-like surrounding for burial and reflection, in contrast to often irregular and semi-maintained church burial grounds, and these spaces usually doubled as parkland in urban areas. Many of these were owned and operated by independent, non-profit cemetery companies, although others were established by local municipalities.

Despite the growth of non-denominational cemeteries during this period, by the turn of the century, a significant proportion of cemeteries in Ontario were still associated with a church, particularly in rural areas, and most of these were in a churchyard or directly adjacent to it, reinforcing the very direct connection between burial and religion which was still very strongly felt by communities across the province. This was particularly the case in rural areas where churches had the land to continue this practice. While these types of cemeteries were established in some small towns and rural communities, including in Kawartha Lakes, they were not the norm in urban areas where garden and non-denominational cemeteries dominated design practice, showing a sharp divide between urban and rural burial practice as it related to land use patterns. However, trends from the garden cemetery movement were often integrated in church yard cemeteries to beautify and enhance them, such as the maintenance of large trees, the creation of paths and gardens, and the retention of open space within the cemetery.

The subject property was developed within this context and is reflective of these trends in nineteenth century cemetery design and development. Known locally as the Graham Cemetery, or alternatively as the Graham Methodist Cemetery, the property was established as a cemetery around 1850 when the first known burial occurred there. The cemetery was established by local Manvers settler and Methodist John Graham who set aside one acre from his 100-acre farm for this purpose, although, unusually, the first burial was not a member of the Graham family, but rather a fellow Methodist, Eliza Irvine, whose family's land grant was some distance from the Grahams. In the early 1850s, a New Connexion Methodist chapel was also built on the site. The exact timeline of development for the cemetery and chapel are not entirely clear as there is little documentation from the property during this period. It is believed that the cemetery was established first and the church, believed to have been constructed between 1851 and 1853, was constructed second although it is likely that the plan to construct a church on this location had already been formed when the cemetery was established; by 1850, the New Connexion congregation in this area was well-established and the crossroads immediately to the south had grown as a small population centre known as Graham's Corners so it is likely that the construction of a church was already in discussion.

For the second half of the nineteenth century, the cemetery functioned, from a functional and landscape perspective, as a churchyard cemetery and as part of a cohesive cultural heritage landscape which comprised the cemetery and the log church that was constructed in the early 1850s. Like many other rural churches throughout Kawartha Lakes and Ontario in general, the cemetery formed a vital part of the church property and functionally, the cemetery and church functioned together as spaces where mourning and burial rites were conducted. The chapel was a log structure and demolished in the 1892 after its congregation merged with Bethany Methodist Church in 1890. Very little documentary evidence of the church exists but it is known to have been located in the northeast corner of the property; in the 1930s, its foundations were identified when the grave for John Challice and his wife, Mary Ann Worr in the early 1930s was dug in that location. With the location of the church in mind, the church and cemetery, throughout the second half of the nineteenth century would have been oriented with the church in the northeast corner, and the graves organized in rough rows to the west and south of the building; this is the location of many of the earliest graves where the headstones remain in place. A number of headstones have been removed from their original context and re-erected along the northern fence line.

After the demolition of the church, the cemetery continued to accept burials which were integrated into the existing pattern of headstones, including over where the church was located, as can be seen from the Challice grave. These burials continued throughout the twentieth century and into the twenty-first

century, although the burials became fewer after the 1950s and fewer new headstones were integrated into the landscape. The cemetery remains active, but does not accept the purchase of new lots, rather remaining open to allow for the interment of the owners of any plots which have already been purchased but not yet received a burial.

The cemetery has few defined landscape features, beyond its fencing which is not original but has existed in some form since the nineteenth century, and its mature trees which line the perimeter of the cemetery. There are no defined paths or artificial landscape features in the cemetery beyond the headstones themselves, which is typical of rural cemeteries of this type from the mid-nineteenth century. The cemetery's most notable landscape feature is the relative steep slope on its southern side where the graves are stepped down the slope and several on the southeast corner of the property have retaining walls on their lower sides to address this challenge. The slope is not a designed feature but reflects the natural topography of the lot and the hilly nature of this area of Manvers Township.

On a more granular level, the headstones within the cemetery reflect similar patterns of design as in other rural cemeteries of this age and type. A 1990 survey of the cemetery identified 118 monuments in the cemetery and an additional four burials have been added since that period; there may be additional graves that are unmarked and unknown, likely from the 1850s. The majority of nineteenth century graves are vertical slabs, with a selection of obelisk monuments which date from the last quarter of the nineteenth century and later; this is highly typical of the usage of different gravestone types in rural Ontario. Newer twentieth and twenty first century stones are largely the thicker granite slab headstones favoured during this period. The historic slab gravestones are all typical of the second half of the nineteenth century and range from very plain rectangular graves with very limited decoration, to more ornate slabs with more complex heads, carved motifs such as lambs, clasped hands, and willows that were common funerary symbols in nineteenth century Ontario, and even poetry on some examples. This is highly typical of gravestones from this period and demonstrate the design elements of a nineteenth century rural cemetery.

The Graham Cemetery is one of eleven known cemeteries in Manvers Township, most of which date to the mid-nineteenth century and were established as churchyard cemeteries. Six of the cemeteries, including Graham's were associated with Methodist churches, as the Methodists church, specifically the New Connexion, had a significant presence in Manvers Township throughout the nineteenth century, prior to the creation of the United Church of Canada. Like Graham's, nearly all of these churches have been demolished, leaving behind their cemeteries; the churches associated with most of these cemeteries were largely log or frame churches erected in

the mid-nineteenth century as part of the first wave of church building across the township and were gradually removed in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. This is particularly the case for the Methodist churches where waves of church consolidations in the 1870s, 1880s, and 1920s left a large number of churches vacant. These cemetery properties, from a design perspective, are very similar to one another in their layout, landscaping and design features, showing a consistent pattern of design across cemeteries in the area which is typified by the Graham Cemetery.

Historical and Associative Value

1047 Porter Road has historical and associative value in its role as the Graham Cemetery. Originally established as the cemetery for the Graham Methodist Church, it is directly associated with the growth of the Methodist Church in Manvers Township, with specific associations with the New Connexion Methodists who established the church in the early 1850s. Through the surviving cemetery, the property yields information regarding this religious denomination in Manvers Township and death and burial in this community. The property also has direct historical connections with early Manvers settler John Graham who donated the land for the cemetery and church and whose family was a prominent group of early settlers in Manvers.

Manvers Township was first surveyed for non-indigenous settlement between 1816 and 1817 by Samuel S. Wilmot, and the first non-indigenous settlers likely arrived around 1820, although several families who bought portions of the clergy reserves may have arrived slightly earlier. However, settlement throughout the first several decades was slow and by 1842, there were 111 households in the townships, most of whom were engaged in agricultural work. Industries and businesses, such as mills, blacksmiths and stores, had yet to become established, although these soon followed.

One of the earliest families to arrive in the township was the Graham family who came from Ireland to what was then Durham County in the early nineteenth century. It is not entirely clear when they arrived in Manvers, but there were several nuclear families who are believed to have arrived in Manvers in the early 1820s, as well as immediately across the township line in Cavan. One of these early settlers was Captain William Graham who was later a member of the Durham Artillery and the first treasurer of Manvers Township when it was established as a municipal entity in 1850.

Graham had at least three sons, all born in Ireland, with his wife Mary Lightle although information about the family is not well documented. The eldest son, John, was born in 1809, with a second Thomas born in 1813 and a third, William, in 1820. The family may have had other children, as well but they not recorded. The family likely arrived soon after in the early 1820s and the first land grants were made to them in what would eventually be the area around Bethany.

The land grants for the family were made in Concession 8 with William Graham the elder receiving the north half of Lot 20 in 1852 and John Graham was granted the south half in 1847. Thomas Graham also received the adjacent Lot 21 while William Graham, the younger, moved to Cavan upon his marriage to Hannah Grandy of Cavan, where he served as the postmaster between 1858 and 1869. By the late 1870s, the 1878 Durham County Atlas recorded that the Grahams farmed nearly 600 acres in and around Bethany. At this time, the family was well-known in the community and prosperous and the Atlas noted that the elder William Graham was still alive at the age of 90, stating “[h]e has acquired a competence for his old age, and has succeeded in placing the members of his family in comfortably circumstances.”¹

By the mid-nineteenth century, a very small settlement had grown up in this area at the corner of what is now Highway 7A and Porter Road. This settlement was known locally as Graham’s Corners, which is generally regarded as the precursor to Bethany as the settlement centre in this area of the township. The grist mill built by James Preston was located immediately to the south of the corners and a small store was built there by John Grandy, the younger brother of Hannah Grandy. This settlement eventually disappeared; with the arrival of the Port Hope, Lindsay and Beaverton Railway in Bethany in 1856, settlement became directed towards the village and away from the nascent settlement at Graham’s Corners.

Alongside the small settlement, the Grahams, along with their neighbours, also built a small log church for the local Methodist congregation; the Grahams themselves and many of the settlers on the surrounding farms were Methodists and this was the formalized place of worship for this religious denomination. At this time, the Methodist population in Manvers was significant and there was a need for houses of worship to accommodate them. In the 1851, 742 Methodists were recorded, alongside 638 Presbyterian, 1184 Anglicans, and 2 Roman Catholics in a population of just 2568 people; although not the largest denomination, the Methodists represented nearly 30% of the population’s township.

In the mid-nineteenth century, however, the Methodists were divided. Methodism, in its earliest form, had arisen from the teachings, preaching and leadership of Anglican minister John Wesley in 1830s England which emphasized God’s grace, a personal relationship with Jesus, and holiness in everyday life, as well as a strong focus on evangelism. Until the late nineteenth century, the Methodists, in alignment with Wesley’s wishes, remain part of the Church of England, but in 1795, four years after Wesley’s death, the Methodists formally split to form their own church, the Wesleyan Methodist Church.

¹ *Illustrated Historical Atlas of the Counties of Northumberland and Durham* (Toronto: H. Beldon and Co, 1878), vi.

However, this unity of purpose did not last long as internal schisms led to the formation of several Methodist churches, with the Methodist New Connexion breaking off in 1797, followed by the Primitive Methodists in 1811 and the Bible Christians in 1815, alongside a wide array of other smaller Methodist groups. These groups were broadly similar both theologically and liturgically, but tended to differ on matters of church polity, as well as issues around the administration of the sacraments and ordination. The New Connexion Methodists, for example, largely split from their parent body, due to conflicts regarding the role of the laity in church governance which the New Connexion adherents felt should be more substantial. These splinters remained in place throughout most of the nineteenth century, both in Britain and its colonies where Methodism was imported with the expansion of empire; in Canada for example, the various Methodist denominations did not consolidate under one banner until 1884 with the creation of the Methodist Church of Canada, which itself became a cornerstone of the United Church of Canada in 1925.

The first Methodist missionaries came to what is now Canada in the late eighteenth century when they arrived in Atlantic Canada to proselytize amongst settlers and military members, as well as to attempt to convert Indigenous people to Christianity. Methodism first came in full force to Upper Canada, later Ontario, in the 1780s with the arrival of United Empire Loyalists in the southern part of the province from the United States, many of whom were Methodists and other dissenting Christians. Both the Bay of Quinte and Niagara regions soon both became important outposts of Methodism in Upper Canada and from these areas, large Methodist circuits were formed to minister to the settlers who had arrived from the United States and those who began to arrive from Britain in the front townships in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. These circuits were attended by itinerate ministers, often missionaries from Britain or the United States, who would travel long distances on horseback or foot to minister to scattered homesteads and villages that were beginning to form at this time. Most early services were held in homes, barns or outdoors, prior to the construction of churches and meeting halls.

By the time Manvers Township was surveyed for settlement, Methodists and their circuits were well established in Upper Canada's front townships and, as the frontier of survey and settlement moved further north, the circuit riders came with them. Methodist meetings began in the Bethany area at least as early as the 1840s although possibly earlier. Manvers, at this time, was part of the Cavan circuit which was ministered to by the Rev. Moses Blackstock. Blackstock was born in Cavan, Ireland in 1793 and immigrated to Cavan Township in Upper Canada around 1818 to work as a missionary in Durham County, along with his wife Jane Morrow and her parents, Robert Morrow and Letitia Mehary; two of his brothers, George and John, followed him to Upper Canada in the following years.

Blackstock first began preaching in Cavan around 1820, first using his house and the houses of other Methodists for gathering. Blackstock was a member of the New Connexion Methodists and his circuit was associated with that group, and eventually with the formation of a Canadian New Connexion Church. Over the next two decades, Blackstock gradually expanded the reach of the church throughout Cavan and Manvers, as settlement continued. By the 1840s, his circuit included twelve points, including the Bethany area. It is not known when the first services were held in the area, but they are believed to have been held in Josiah Wilson's barn to the east of where Bethany is now situated. At this time, both the Presbyterians and the Methodists worshipped together, given the small size of the population and the availability of ministers as both Presbyterian and Methodist ministers visited the settlement on an irregular basis due to the large circuits they covered; this was common practice in areas as settlement began and slowly expanded.

The Grahams, long time members of the New Connexion Methodists, built the log church on their property at some point between 1850 and 1853 to provide a dedicated meeting space for the New Connexion congregation. The 1850s, in this area of Upper Canada, marked the first major push towards church construction as communities that has first been established in the 1820s and 1830s finally had enough resources to construct buildings other than homes, agricultural buildings, and small local industrial structures; this was also a time when early schools began to be erected. Manvers' earliest churches are all from this time period and were all New Connexion Methodist chapels including the Graham Chapel. Other denominations quickly followed including at St. Mary's Anglican Church in Lifford (1852), and Ballyduff Presbyterian Church (1853), the last of which is the township's oldest extant church. It is notable that, at least for the early years of its existence, the Presbyterians continued to worship jointly in the Graham Chapel; a Presbyterian church was not built in Bethany until 1872. The chapel identified itself as a New Connexion church and continued to do so, until 1874 when the New Connexion Methodists merged with the Wesleyan Methodist Church in Canada and the Wesleyan Methodist Conference of Eastern British North America to become the Methodist Church of Canada; the final merger of Canada's Methodist sects into a single church across the country came just 10 years later in 1884. Prior to these mergers, the New Connexion Church was particularly strong in Manvers, more so than in the surrounding townships in Durham, Peterborough and Victoria, and a large number of New Connexion chapels were built across the township, beginning around the same time as the Graham chapel was erected. The 1851 census recorded only three ministers living in Manvers – one Anglican and two New Connexion Methodists – and of the 742 Methodists in the township, 563 were New Connexion members.

Alongside the church, a cemetery was also established as a burial ground for the local Methodist congregation; it is not clear if the cemetery was opened

before or after the church was built. The earliest burial in the graveyard is believed to have been 42-year-old Eliza Irvine, who died in May 1850 and was likely interred at the cemetery shortly after; her son John was buried alongside her the following year. It is notable that the Irvines did not live close to the Graham cemetery. Their farm, which was retained by her husband William until at least the 1870s, was located in Concession 14, well to the north of the Graham property, underlining the importance of creating a burial ground for Methodists not just in the immediate area of Graham's Corners, but in Manvers more broadly. Burials of other Methodists in the community followed throughout the 1850s and 1860s, including William H. Graham, the infant son of William Graham and Hannah Grandy who themselves were eventually interred in the cemetery, in 1863. John Graham himself was also interred in the cemetery that he had established upon his death in 1884 at the age of 75.

At this time, the development of cemeteries in concert with churches was standard practice in Upper Canada. Churchyard cemeteries were common in Christian burial practice since the early days of Christianity and this practice and form of land use followed European Christians who emigrated to Canada in the nineteenth century. However, upon arriving in Upper Canada, early emigrants were faced with a landscape where the traditional ritual markers of death and burial – namely churches and cemeteries – were non-existent. The majority of early burials occurred in family cemeteries that were established as individual members of settler families died or in communal plots established by the small local communities as they grew, even prior to the construction of a church which would often establish a cemetery for the members of its own congregation. Typically, when a church was constructed, a cemetery was established along with it. This remained the case throughout the second half of the nineteenth century in rural areas, although in more urban areas, the shift to non-denominational garden cemeteries had begun in the mid-nineteenth century.

It is not clear if the cemetery was established first because Graham's Corners had grown into a small community in this area of Manvers Township and the church was built in the location for that reason or if the church was constructed first and the cemetery established next to it. It is generally believed that the cemetery was established first, based largely on the dates of the earliest burials, although there are not definitive records regarding the church construction from this period. The dates of establishment of the cemetery and the church are so close to one another that making this determination is not possible. However, by 1853, the result was the same: a Methodist church and cemetery for the local congregation at Graham's Corners. A parsonage was also built here in 1855 although nothing is known about it.

By the late 1850s, the population of this area of Manvers had begun to shift with the growth of Bethany as the area's primary population centre. With the

arrival of the Port Hope, Lindsay and Beaverton Railway in Bethany in 1856, the population centre in the area shifted from Graham's Corners to Bethany; by 1866, the population of Bethany had grown to 300 and boasted a range of stores, and services as well as several hotels and a school built in 1862. Churches were soon constructed in the village, including St. Paul's Anglican Church in 1876. However, Graham's Chapel remained the Methodist worship space in the area until 1870 when another New Connexion chapel was built in Bethany itself. This church was donated on land in the village donated by Charles and Catherine Reynolds, and was a small frame building for the New Connexions members in the growing village; a parsonage was constructed shortly after in 1876. It is likely that the construction of this church stemmed from two factors. The first was the growth of Bethany as a population centre in Manvers Township and the influx of new church members into the village; the number of Methodists in Manvers by this time had swelled to 1,835, including 1,125 members of the New Connexion recorded in the 1871 census and was the largest religious group in the township. The second reason was likely the beginnings of discussions regarding the merger of the Methodist churches in Canada at this time, and the desire to have a church itself in the village if and when that occurred and the understanding that churches would eventually merge and some close. With the construction of the Bethany church, there were now two New Connexion chapels in very close proximity to one another but both remained open and on the same circuit. The New Connexion circuit at this time included the entirety of Manvers Townships, and many of its trustees were from prominent local families associated with the churches at Bethany and at Graham's Corners, including Isaac Preston, John Richmond Taylor, Thomas Magee, James Brown, James Wilson, and Charles Cain.

In the years following the construction of the Bethany church, the changes came quickly for Methodists in Canada. In 1874, the creation of the Methodist Church of Canada, as noted above and which included the New Connexion Church, quickly brought the majority of the Methodist churches in Manvers under the umbrella of a single church organization, with the exception of the Bible Christians and Primitive Methodists whose numbers in the township had always been quick small. The original splinters within Methodism were largely a result of church polity in the British and American contexts which were becoming increasingly irrelevant in the Canadian church and church leadership was largely shifting their focus from ministering to early settlers and spreading the gospel amongst scattered populations to establishing institutional relevance in the new Canadian context and the drive towards social and moral influence in the young country. The final merger of the Methodist churches in 1884 brought all of the Methodist congregations under one umbrella for the first time in Canada.

Beyond the larger goals that church leadership had for the merger of the Methodist churches, the mergers presented real, practical challenges for local congregations, including in Manvers Township. After the church merger, many Methodist congregations had to make the decision as to where to worship, as the Church was suddenly in possession of a large number of chapels and churches which were often in very close proximity to one another and, in rural areas such as Manvers, sometimes had quite small congregations simply because there were so many Methodist churches within a small geographic area. Fleetwood, for example, had both a New Connexion and a Bible Christian chapel prior to 1884 despite the fact that only about 50 people lived there; after the church merger, these two congregations joined together to worship in the Bible Christian chapel.

Closer to Bethany, the Graham chapel and the Bethany church faced a similar challenge. The two churches were only about a kilometre distance from one another but each had distinct reasons for staying open: the Bethany church was located in the area's population centre and was the larger church, while the Graham chapel was the original congregation but also had possession of the cemetery. The two congregations continued to worship separately from each other, despite their extremely close proximity until 1890 when the Graham Chapel closed and the two congregations merged in the Bethany church. The Graham chapel, which was likely in poor physical condition given its age and log construction, was demolished in 1892.

With the closure of the church, the amalgamated congregation in Bethany continued to use the cemetery as the local Methodist burying ground. The cemetery was operated by the church although its ownership was not firmly established from a legal perspective. The cemetery was originally established by John Graham and located on his property. Graham sold the property to Adam Preston in 1874, but only a 99-acre parcel which did not include the church and cemetery that, by this time, were well-established. The property returned to the Graham family in 1883 when it was acquired by Thomas Roland Graham, and then by John H. Graham in 1902. At this point, the cemetery had not legally been transferred to the Methodist church in Bethany, although the congregation continued to use it for burials and appears to have maintained it.

This arrangement was not at all uncommon for early settler cemeteries in rural Ontario during this time period and it was, in part, because of this informal arrangement that regularly existed that the Ontario Historical Society, which was founded in 1888 as the Pioneer Association of Ontario, began the push for greater cemetery oversight and maintenance in Ontario's early settler cemeteries. Many of these cemeteries were not well-maintained, often because ownership was not well-established, and no regulation existing to govern their

continued use. This led to the passage of the Cemetery Act in 1927 which set standards for the creation, enlargement, maintenance and operation of cemeteries in the province.

Although the Act did not stipulate who could or could not own a cemetery, it did provide regulations and requirements for cemetery owners that they were required to follow on a range of topics such as the sale and maintenance of plots, requirements for fencing and general cemetery maintenance provisions. This meant that a person or corporation was required to take responsibility for a cemetery, often leading to the creation of cemetery trusts and boards who took ownership of these cemeteries where arrangements had previously been informal.

The Bethany Methodist Church Cemetery Board, which took ownership and responsibility for the cemetery, was actually formed in 1921; although this predated the passage of the Cemetery Act, these conversations regarding cemetery ownership and maintenance were happening at this time and many rural churches and owners who had these informal cemetery arrangements moved towards the creation of cemetery boards at the time leading up to the legislation. The board was formed by the Bethany Methodist Church and its original board included the Reverend James Edwin Bickell who was the minister at the Bethany Methodist Church, and congregants John Porteous, Robert McMullen, Ernest Beer, Thomas Jackson, and George Spencer. A declaration of trust was registered on the cemetery in June 1921, establishing the ownership and governance of the property. Burials continued throughout this period. The Board was eventually renamed the Graham Cemetery Board. In 2009, the City of Kawartha Lakes assumed ownership of the cemetery under its cemetery license. The cemetery continues to be operational, although plots are no longer sold.

Overall, the subject property has historical and associative value through its role as the Graham Cemetery. The cemetery has been operational on this location since around 1850 and is directly related to the historic development of the Methodist Church in Manvers Township throughout the nineteenth century. It yields information regarding death and burial for this particular Christian denomination in the Bethany area at this time, from the time of the cemetery's development until the present day.

Contextual Value

1047 Porter Road has contextual value as part of the broader, historic rural character of the area of Manvers Township around Bethany. As an early settler cemetery, the property forms part of a broader rural agricultural landscape that includes a variety of features that, taken together, define the rural, dispersed community as a cohesive whole. These include agricultural properties, natural features, and institutional structures and properties

including the cemetery which was established alongside a New Connexion Methodist chapel. It is historically linked to its surroundings as part of the development of rural Manvers Township in the mid-nineteenth century and the area where the cemetery is located retains a variety of features and land use patterns that are historically connected to this period and to each other. The property is a local landmark both its historic value and association with early residents of the Bethany area, but also as an active local cemetery. The property has served as a burial site for the local area since the early 1850s and is well-known in Manvers Township.

In the nineteenth century, cemeteries were central aspect of the fabric of community life, both from a functional standpoint and from a land use one. Death and dying were frequent aspects of life, particularly during the early settlement period, and the rituals associated with death, including memorialization and burial, were common and accepted aspects of how Victorian settlers lived. As a result, the cemetery became an important community space as a memorial site for deceased community members. In rural areas, such as Manvers Township, they took on central roles in the ritual life of the community which was dispersed over large and, in the early settlement period, difficult to navigate areas, but came together in the cemetery space for memorialization and remembrance. In the case of the Graham cemetery, as it was for many rural cemeteries and particularly those associated with a church or chapel as the subject property is, the community was very specifically defined around its denominational affiliation, as well as the geographic area. For the Graham cemetery, that denominational community was quite large, given the substantial New Connexion Methodist in Manvers Township throughout the nineteenth century. Cemeteries were often established early and grew alongside the community and its burial needs.

Within the rural landscape, the cemetery formed an important aspect of the local land use fabric and, in the nineteenth century, were accepted part of this landscape that functioned in tandem with other land use types, including agriculture and small-scale commercial and industrial enterprises. Although the role of the cemetery in community life and the understanding of its importance within the rural fabric has declined since the nineteenth century, rural cemeteries, such as the Graham Cemetery, still form important aspect of the rural historic landscape and help define it through the contrasting land use between cemetery and other uses.

At the subject property, the immediate surrounding uses are all agricultural, although the cemetery is in close proximity to Bethany and other land uses within the hamlet. The surrounding properties largely retain their historic buildings and land use patterns, although there are certainly more modern buildings in the area. Like many cemeteries of this type, the subject property remains located in a rural area dispersed; when many early cemeteries of this

type were created, they were often at distance from settlement centres or not close to a settlement centre at all, by virtue of who donated the land and where it was located. As a result, the cemetery became, and in this case remains, an integral aspect of the rural landscape that maintained and supported the patterns of rural land use and, in the present day, its continuing character.

The property is also historically connected to its surroundings as part of the rural development of this area of Manvers Township in the middle of the nineteenth century. Manvers Township was surveyed for settlement in 1816 and 1817 and settlement followed soon after. Settlement was relatively slow during the first few decades of non-Indigenous settlement in the area, but accelerated by the 1830s and 1840s with new settlers moving into the area and taking up land throughout the township, including the area around present-day Bethany where the subject property is located. As settlement accelerated and settlers became more established in their new environment, they set about creating familiar patterns of landscape and the built environment. This included the establishment of institutional places and spaces, including churches and cemeteries.

The subject property was originally designed as a church and cemetery complex in the early 1850s, including the New Connexion chapel and associated denominational cemetery; the church was demolished in 1892 and only the cemetery remains in situ. However, the cemetery, and associated church, were both established at a time when Manvers Township was becoming more firmly established as an agricultural region in the middle decades of the nineteenth century. The land use patterns, which remain largely extant in the present day, had been established in its initial survey but were consolidated during this period, particularly with the establishment of Bethany as the township's primary population centre just to the east of the subject property. The setting aside of the land for the church and cemetery was part of this pattern of growth and development from this time period, and the cemetery retains effectively the same land mass and relationship to the large surrounding agricultural parcels as it did when it was originally established.

In addition to its relationship to the broader rural landscape in this area, the cemetery is a local landmark. Known locally as the Graham Cemetery, and designated as such by its current operator the City of Kawartha Lakes, the cemetery first opened for burials around 1850 and is well-known in the Bethany area and in Manvers Township in general as a long-standing burial ground. At the time the cemetery was opened, it was associated with an adjacent Methodist church that was a significant community institution in the Bethany area until its closure in 1890; the cemetery then passed to what is now the Bethany United Church which continued to operate it, through a cemetery board, as a burying place for its congregation. Although the cemetery is now

operated by the City of Kawartha Lakes. The cemetery remains an active burial site. In addition to its general importance in the area as a local cemetery, the property is also connected to a number of important families who have members interred there and who are well known in Bethany and the surrounding area. These include members of the Graham family themselves who donated the land for the cemetery and continued to own the farm around it, as well as other prominent local families who were members of the Methodist church. The cemetery continued to be associated with the Bethany United Church until its transfer to the City of Kawartha Lakes in 2009 and retained important community and landmark significance for the United Church congregation in the area.

Summary of Reasons for Designation

The short statement of reasons for designation and the description of the heritage attributes of the property, along with all other components of the Heritage Designation Brief, constitute the Reasons for Designation required under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Short Statement of Reasons for Designation

Design and Physical Value

1047 Porter Road has design and physical value as a representative example of a mid-nineteenth century rural cemetery. The cemetery was established in approximately 1850 as a burial ground for the local New Connexion Methodist congregation alongside a chapel constructed on the same site around the same time, which has been demolished. Through its landscaping, layout and orientation, the cemetery is demonstrative of the kinds of rural churchyard cemeteries established in the mid-nineteenth century, particularly in contrast to the growing trend of landscaped garden cemeteries being established in urban centres. The cemetery is one of eleven cemeteries in Manvers Township and one of the several that were established in the township around this period. It remains an important example of an early Methodist cemetery in Manvers Township.

Historical and Associative Value

1047 Porter Road has historical and associative value in its role as the Graham Cemetery. Originally established as the cemetery for the Graham Methodist Church, it is directly associated with the growth of the Methodist Church in Manvers Township, with specific associations with the New Connexion Methodists who established the church in the early 1850s. Through the surviving cemetery, the property yields information regarding this religious denomination in Manvers Township and death and burial in this community. The property also has direct historical connections with early Manvers settler John Graham who donated the land for the cemetery and church and whose family was a prominent group of early settlers in Manvers.

Contextual Value

1047 Porter Road has contextual value as part of the broader, historic rural character of the area of Manvers Township around Bethany. As an early settler cemetery, the property forms part of a broader rural agricultural landscape that includes a variety of features that, taken together, define the rural, dispersed community as a cohesive whole. These include agricultural properties, natural features, and institutional structures and properties including the cemetery which was established alongside a New Connexion Methodist chapel. It is historically linked to its surroundings as part of the development of rural Manvers Township in the mid-nineteenth century and the area where the cemetery is located retains a variety of features and land use

patterns that are historically connected to this period and to each other. The property is a local landmark both its historic value and association with early residents of the Bethany area, but also as an active local cemetery. The property has served as a burial site for the local area since the early 1850s and is well-known in Manvers Township.

Summary of Heritage Attributes to be Designated

The Reasons for Designation include the following heritage attributes and apply to all elevations, unless otherwise specified, and the roof including: all façades, entrances, windows, chimneys, and trim, together with construction materials of wood, brick, stone, stucco, concrete, plaster parging, metal, glazing, their related building techniques and landscape features.

Design and Physical Attributes

The design and physical attributes of the property support its value as a mid-nineteenth century rural settler cemetery.

- 1 acre lot size
- Historic headstones
- Irregular headstone layout in approximate rows
- Mature trees and vegetation
- Grassy lawns
- Limited landscaping

Historical and Associative Value

The historical and associative value of the property supports its value as a mid-nineteenth century settler cemetery in Manvers Township and its association with the Methodist congregation in the area near Bethany.

- 1 acre lot size
- Headstones and burials related to historic members of Manvers' Methodist community
- Association with adjacent former Graham homestead

Contextual Value

The contextual value of the property supports its value as a local landmark and as a contributing part of the historic rural landscape of this part of Manvers Township near Bethany.

- Views from the cemetery of the surrounding rural area
- Sloped lot
- Views of the cemetery from Porter Road
- Relationship to the surrounding rural agricultural properties

Images







Bibliography

Airhart, Phyllis C. *Serving the Present Age: Revivalism, Progressivism and the Methodist Tradition in Canada*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1992.

Carr, Violet, ed. *The Rolling Hills*. Manvers Township Council, 1967.

Chalice, Isabelle and Grant Curtis. *Spirit of the Hills*. Bethany, Manvers Township Historical Society, n.d.

Hall, Roger and Bruce Bowden. "Beautifying the Boneyard: The Changing Image of a Cemetery in Nineteenth-Century Ontario." *Material Culture Review* 23 (1986): 13-24.

Hanks, Carol. *Early Ontario Gravestones*. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, 1974.

Leetooze, Sherell Branton. *Churches of Old Durham County*. Bowmanville: Lynn Michael-John Associates, 2013.

Leetooze, Sherell Branton. *The Trail Through the Bush: A Brief History of Manvers Township*. Bowmanville: Lynn Michael-John Associates, 1998.

Morton, Kathy. *Reflections of Bethany*. Bloomfield: County Magazine Printshop, 2019.

Mytum, Harold. *Mortuary Monuments and Burial Grounds of the Historic Period*. New York: Kluwer Academic, 2004.

Norris, Darrell A. "Ontario Gravestones." *Markers: Annual Journal of the Association for Gravestone Studies* 5 (1988): 123-149.

Russell, Lynn and Patricia Stone. "Gravestone Carvers of Early Ontario." *Material Culture Review* 18 (1983): 37-39.

Sanderson, J.E. *The First Century of Methodism in Canada*. Toronto: W. Briggs, 1910.

Semple, Neil. *The Lord's Dominion: The History of Canadian Methodism*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1996.

Smart, Susan. *A Better Place: Death and Burial in Nineteenth Century Ontario*. Toronto: Dundurn Press, 2011.

Williams, Ron. *Landscape Architecture in Canada*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2014.

Wilson, Pearl and Laura Morton. *Rural Gatherings*. Lindsay: F.W. Hall, 1983.